Indonesia’s Clean Cookstove Initiative
Too Many Cooks Spoil the Social Marketing Broth

Dr Nicholas Goodwin, Director, Tulodo

World Social Marketing Conference
16 May 2017
Washington D.C.
What we will cover today

1. Clean cooking and behavior change study
2. Indonesia’s Clean Cookstove Initiative
3. Questions and Discussion
Study of behavior change approaches in clean cooking

• Strong feeling among cookstove people that they have been working on behavior change for **years**.

• The clean cooking/HAP sector faces something of a **crisis**

• Governments, donors, etc hungry for **solutions to leapfrog** beyond incremental change and **scale up for real impact**.

• Our journey from discussing whether the issue is an engineering, economic or social one to seeing solutions as based in a wide range of **connected human needs and behaviors**.
Selected Findings

• Little evidence of BCT impact and behavioral outcomes
• Few design and evaluations use behavioural models and theories.
• Limited innovation in BCTs used.
• Successful interventions consider barriers/benefits along the value chain.
• Effective interventions have a mix of approaches/BCTs
• Removing financial barriers are essential.
• Journey to scale: some evidence of successful programs reaching a “tipping point” where the new technology became the norm.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Indonesia’s kerosene to LPG conversion: Pertamina</strong></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Activities and Behaviour Change Techniques</strong></td>
<td>National legislative framework; engagement of local government; preparation of agents and retailers in supply chain; distribution and socialisation to households. BCTs:</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Shaping knowledge</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Social support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Comparisons</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Goals planning and monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Results</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 44 million stove packages provided in 15 provinces.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- USD2.9 billion saved in kerosene subsidies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 8 LPG terminals, 53 LPG cylinder factories, 31 stove factories, 14 regulator producers, and 22 filling stations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- USD1.7 billion of investment.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- 28,176 new jobs created.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduced CO2 emissions by 8.4 million tonnes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduced household fuel expenditure by 30%.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Conclusions</strong></td>
<td>Success due to understanding demand and anticipation of the barriers to change. National regulation combined with an integrated community mobilization programme. Change agents provided confidence.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Indonesia’s Clean Cookstove Initiative (2012-2030)
The plan

- Provide affordable, biomass-fueled cookstoves to 24.5 million families – or 40% of households across Indonesia – by 2030.
- Model chosen was Results Based Finance (RBF), which disburses public resources against demonstrated results, focused on mobilizing private sector.
- Stove subsidy approach for suppliers to build market
- Stove testing based on consumer research
- $1.4 million in grants for the pilot in two locations – Central Java and Sumba.
Competition

Segmentation and Insight

Important Design Features of Cookstove (1)

- Start fire quickly: 39% Very important, 61% Important, 0% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Durable: 32% Very important, 67% Important, 1% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Give high heat/Cook fast: 36% Very important, 63% Important, 1% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Use less fuel: 27% Very important, 70% Important, 2% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Convenient and easy to operate: 6% Very important, 92% Important, 1% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Can easily remove and/or add fuel: 4% Very important, 91% Important, 5% Not so important, 1% Do not know
- Can promptly reduce or increase heat: 7% Very important, 84% Important, 6% Not so important, 2% Do not know
- Emits less smoke: 8% Very important, 82% Important, 8% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Can use any type of biomass fuels i.e., FW, coconut shell,...: 6% Very important, 84% Important, 10% Not so important, 0% Do not know
- Can use different size – diameter- of firewood: 5% Very important, 82% Important, 12% Not so important, 0% Do not know

Akulah TSHE
TUNGKU SEHAT, TUNGKU TAK BERPOLUSI

MENAAK DENGAN TUNGKU
SEPERTI INI SETIAP HARI?
boros kayu
dapur kotor
tidak kotor
tidak hitam
tidak nyaman
tidak aman
tidak sehat

AYO UBAH KEBIASAAN LAMA! PAKAI
TSHE
TUNGKU SEHAT HEMAT ENERGI

TSHE SOLUSI MASA DEPAN
Tungku Sehat Hemat Energi
Reported results of pilot

- 50 different stove models tested, about a third met quality standards.
- Focus on drive to recruit 10 “market aggregators”—legal entities such as stove producers, wholesalers, and retailers willing to take investment risks—selected some of those models to sell.
- Planned sales of 5,500 stoves by end 2016 - 80% of the 7,000 target.
- October 2016: around 1,000 stoves confirmed sold.
- Final results yet to be released, evaluation currently underway.
Tulodo and Kopernik experience with implementation

- Brand did not resonate strongly with consumers
- Lack of marketing resources, especially for local level
- Category marketing support not visible and not coordinated enough
- Product demonstrations limited
- Local partners did not have incentives for sales.
- Consumers did not receive subsidies or other incentives.
- Lack of development of finance options for consumers.
Conclusions

• Failing to meet intended users’ needs and preferences is a key obstacle to adoption.

• Health, price and fuel access not major desired benefits.

• Strong desire to change based on speed, ease of use and cleanliness (or person and kitchen)

• Drivers for change are more emotional and affective, rather than the more rational health or economic benefits.
Conclusions

- Choice of location meant clean(er) stoves competing with cleaner and faster LPG.
- Monitoring and verification burden too high and discouraged companies from participating and slowed sales.
- Social marketing strategy was researched and developed and only partially funded or implemented.
Recommendations

- Refocus marketing away from health threats and toward the emotional and affect drivers for change and values important to consumers.
- Invest in marketing, consumer value creation and demand generation. Hystra (2013) suggested that approximately 60% of consumers decide to purchase stoves based on what friends and relatives recommend.
- Develop partnerships with local and national finance service providers to ensure choice and flexibility for consumers.
- Ensure choice of technology meets consumer needs – consider electric and LPG to replace biomass.
- Train and equip partners in marketing and community mobilization.
Thank you!

Contact:

Nicholas Goodwin
Director, Tulodo
E: nick@tulodo.com
Twitter: nickgoodwin
Web: tulodo.com